# EXHIBIT P

[October 1, 2019 letter from Eric Vandevelde to Kathleen Hartnett – REDACTED]

### Case 2:10-cv-00106-LRH-VCF Document 1361-16 Filed 07/10/20 Page 2 of 3

## **GIBSON DUNN**

Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP

333 South Grand Avenue Los Angeles, CA 90071-3197 Tel 213.229.7000 www.gibsondunn.com

Eric D. Vandevelde Direct: +1 213.229.7186 Fax: +1 213.229.6186 EVandevelde@gibsondunn.com

October 1, 2019

#### VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL

Kathleen Hartnett Boies Schiller Flexner LLP 44 Montgomery St., 41st Floor San Francisco, CA 94104

Re: Oracle USA, Inc. et al. v. Rimini Street, Inc. & Seth Ravin Case No. 2:10-cv-0106-LRH-VCF (D. Nev.)

Dear Kathleen:

I write in response to your letter of yesterday, September 30, 2019.

As we have discussed in several prior letters, there has been no spoliation of any evidence. Rimini had no obligation to preserve intermediate, duplicate copies of files, and indeed, Rimini candidly informed Oracle of its process of deleting these intermediate, duplicative files from its FTP server almost a year ago—and Oracle raised no issue until now. Rather than rehash these issues, I write specifically regarding Oracle's intended motion to compel, described in your letter. Oracle's motion is unnecessary and would be a waste of judicial resources because Rimini has already agreed to the relief Oracle seeks.

First, Rimini already agreed to search for and produce the files at issue. Indeed, yesterday, Rimini produced approximately such files, and Rimini is continuing to locate additional files. At this time, we do not have a "date certain" by which we can commit to finishing that production, but we anticipate being able to provide you an estimate within a week.

Second, Rimini is already in the processes of modifying its AFW TransferFile tool to preserve the intermediate, duplicate copies at issue. Specifically, the new tool, as modified, will copy the intermediate, duplicate copies to an archived location before deleting them from the FTP folders. Going forward, files sent using the TransferFile tool will be recoverable from this single archived location. To be clear, Rimini is taking this cooperative step in light of Oracle's recent interest in the intermediate, duplicate copies of these files, and the complexity of searching for and producing the original files. By preserving these files going forward in this manner, Rimini is not conceding that it was previously required to so.

# **GIBSON DUNN**

Kathleen Hartnett October 1, 2019 Page 2

Third, Oracle requests that Rimini "preserve all materials related to its support of Oracle software, including all materials on Rimini's AFW FTP server." Rimini will continue to do so, as it has been, consistent with its legal obligations.

Thus, we believe any motion practice is unnecessary and unwarranted. We look forward to speaking with you today on our scheduled teleconference.

Very truly yours,

Eric D. Vandevelde

EDV/cjm

cc: Karen L. Dunn

Kathleen R. Hartnett

William Isaacson

Ashleigh Jensen

Tran Le

Richard J. Pocker

Beko Reblitz-Richardson

Sean Rodriguez

Gabriel Schlabach

Samuel Ungar

Zachary S. Hill

David Kocan

Lisa S. Lee

Jacob J.O. Minne

John A. Polito

Lindsey M. Shinn

Benjamin P. Smith

Sharon R. Smith